

CONCURSO EUROPAN 10

Acta da reunião do Júri e Relatório final

Nos dias 18 e 19 de Setembro e no dia 28 de Novembro decorreram as sessões da reunião do júri do Concurso estando presentes, na primeira sessão de trabalhos todos os nove membros efectivos e na segunda, oito dos seus membros efectivos e um suplente, o Arq^o Sérgio Núncio que substituiu a Arqt^a. Ariella Masbounji, impedida de participar na reunião final com motivo justificado e ficando sem substituição o Arqt^o. Roger Riewe por aviso tardio.

Na sessão inicial procedeu-se à pré-selecção de uma “shortlist” de propostas e na reunião final foram tomadas as decisões relativas à premiação. Do conjunto de propostas pré-seleccionadas na sessão inicial, foi feita recomendação para a análise dos trabalhos no Fórum de Graz (Cidades e Júris). Nessa sessão foi avaliado o relatório da Comissão Técnica sobre a conformidade das propostas com o regulamento e com o programa de cada sítio. O Secretário-Geral apresentou o relatório da Comissão Técnica onde é ponderada a exclusão da proposta SE079, número de entrada 51, por incumprimento do ponto 1.4.4. do Regulamento (“Elementos a entregar pelos concorrentes”). A proposta, não apresentando envelope selado com os documentos de identificação da equipa, compromete irremediavelmente qualquer hipótese de atribuir a autoria do trabalho. A proposta foi aceite unanimemente pelo júri.

Na sessão final, o Presidente propôs como método que se analisasse o relatório da Comissão Técnica relativo à pré-selecção efectuada e à conformidade das propostas com os objectivos dos programas e logo a seguir que se passasse à análise, sítio por sítio, da exequibilidade das soluções das propostas pré-seleccionadas, procedendo-se depois à classificação ordenada e proposta de premiação, de acordo com os critérios definidos no regulamento.

O Júri apreciou a proposta da Comissão Técnica para reanálise da proposta com o código XV896 de acordo com a fundamentação apresentada no relatório da Comissão Técnica, o que foi aceite por unanimidade.

Passou-se de seguida à análise das propostas e à discussão sobre a pertinência dos comentários da Comissão Técnica quanto aos objectivos referidos nos respectivos

programas. Depois de uma análise de todas as propostas pelos critérios estabelecidos no Regulamento, o júri decidiu por maioria, a seguinte classificação ordenada, com a justificação que consta do relatório final.

Cascais

Prémio	BS134
Menção Honrosa	MC197
Citações Especiais	AM237; MV272; OH754; SE232; XV896; UE001

Entroncamento

Prémio	AA051
Menção Honrosa	SG004
Citações Especiais	EN398; MV004; OO000; SM659

Lisboa

Prémio	LX010
Menção Honrosa	GP002
Citações Especiais	AA777; DM193; FA174; XX121

O Júri decidiu manifestar as dificuldades de análise dos trabalhos, fruto de alguma ambiguidade em alguns dos programas quanto às escalas de intervenção e delimitações das áreas componentes, recomendando que em futuras edições seja aferida a dimensão do âmbito geográfico e definição de áreas de trabalho, procurando-se maior simplificação e clareza possível, na formulação dos objectivos de projecto.

Finalmente foi discutida a formulação da fundamentação e aprovadas as linhas gerais a registar na elaboração do Relatório anexo à Acta, tendo sido dado voto de confiança ao Presidente do júri para a sua redacção na especialidade com o apoio do membro Arqtº. Sérgio Nuncio e do Secretário-Geral da European Portugal, Prof. Arqtº Pedro Brandão. O relatório será circulado por todos os membros do júri para confirmação, antes de serem divulgados os resultados. Foi ainda dado um voto de confiança ao Presidente para convocar o acto público de abertura dos envelopes de identificação dos concorrentes, após o que a reunião foi encerrada, com a assinatura da presente acta.

Lisboa, 28 de Novembro de 2009

O júri,

Pedro Botelho Pedro Loure Botelho.

Carlos Prata Carlos Prata

Manuel Graça Dias Manuel Graça Dias

Nuno Lourenço Nuno Lourenço

Álvaro Domingues Álvaro Domingues

Jorge Bonito Jorge Bonito

Ángela García de Paredes Ángela García de Paredes

Sérgio Nuncio Sérgio Nuncio

CONCURSO EUROPAN 10

Relatório final / Final report

A) Evaluation brief for Cascais

Prémio / Winner

BS134 – Very clear and simple proposal with a big triangular design of a central green area, linear organization of buildings alongside the tram line, creates transition permeability between the site and Cabreiro settlement allowing flexibility for future evolution, with eventual growing of the road network. The strategy for a free central green area also allows different adaptations at building layout's level, so as to increase global density and reduce higher concentration next to the hospital. The plaza at the tram stop creates a central point connecting all urban components and the hospital.

Menção Honrosa / Runner-Up

MC197 – Proposal very well organized, linking to the built surroundings of Cabreiro, but with some deficit on differentiated urban design scheme. Along the new avenue, buildings are placed around small patios with unclear accessibility and typological legibility. Excellent architectonic design of facilities (school) and hotel proposal, although low density, lack of privacy options for the housing area and too much empty green space, are not felt as adequate (management costs).

Citação Especial / Honourable Mention

AM237 – Complies with general goals (although exceeding building limits), with careful application of program's specifications regarding facilities and a strong intention of a repetition grid. However, the lozenge shape set is inadequate to the site, assuming an excessive formal and functional constraint to the flexibility of solutions, establishing an excessively rigid scheme of road structure and building form.

Citação Especial / Honourable Mention

MV272 – Proposal of an urban structure which aims to establishing a strong pattern of relations between built environments. However strong points in intentions such as freeing ground space by "pilotis" solutions, the scheme is too rigid, risking bad final results with unclear public space, high management costs, monotonous and disorientating layout. Maximum buildable area is exceeded and no real centrality is created.

Citação Especial / Honourable Mention

OH754 – Proposal of a settlement in dialog with “organic” form of the existing Cabreiro occupation, by the “scattering” of individual houses. Green spaces are well adjusted to the integration of new buildings, and some plots are reserved for agricultural and local open air market. Remaining programme components are poorly developed and the final image is somehow too close to current allotments, concentrated in its own limits, with scarce diversity and too much unoccupied areas with scarce uses.

Citação Especial / Honourable Mention

SE232 – Re-interpretation of the pre-existing in a relatively disperse occupation with scattered blocks trying to achieve some kind of unity and trying to solve some discontinuities. New architectural models’ typology research, however, doesn’t avoid the dilemma between monotony and unity. Pedestrian circulation underneath buildings and too much leftover space creates unsecure features and high management costs. Centrality functions don’t contribute significantly to a convincing urban image.

Citação Especial / Honourable Mention

UE001 – An important text on urban growing in “colonization” dynamics of peripheral settlements, economic logics and professional ethics, also gives useful reflexion on European site choosing. As a critical approach it doesn’t manage the contradiction between the text and ideas for its architectural translation.

Citação Especial / Honourable Mention

XV896 – Generally answers correctly to the programmatic goals. It establishes a “colonization” approach similar to other selected proposal (AM237) on the creation of a cellular net applied to the project area, with more flexibility between urban design and architectural form and stronger relation to Cabreiro, however with an unclear and insufficient road network and lack of visible differentiation with current allotments.

B) Evaluation brief for Entroncamento

Prémio / Winner

AA051 – The proposal manages the idea of an urban system featuring an urban park coexisting with different uses by stitching them together with pathways and landscaping geometries and by providing an unifying visual element between the railway

infrastructure and the proposed surrounding urban fabric. The system acts as a visual, spatial and acoustic separation of the building area in relation to the railway thus fulfilling one of the main goals for the transformation of the site. The renovated residential area is in close connection to the green structure making good use of a contemporary approach to the patio-house type.

A new and iconic crossing spot is created by the "Bridge Shopping", providing an urban link to the surrounding town's two sides as stressed in the programme as an important goal. Albeit conflicting with technical and legal issues it may be possible to overcome these constraints by redesigning or rethinking the concept and eventual location for this building.

Finally, from a practical point of view the proposed urban structure does allow for a phased implementation.

Menção Honrosa / Runner-Up

SG004 – This proposal approaches the project by using the railway lines as an organic structure for the whole design, inspired in the garden-city theme as well as in the railway lines taken as a fluid structure for the whole design.

In this sense the proposal is a formal reference to a railway-related memory, a living and inhabited monument to the origins of this urban nucleus and an architectural metaphor or reinterpretation of the notion of mobility. Buildings and pedestrian paths intertwine in what seems to be a single yet complex high-tech construction that mixes uses in a new urban design, suspended above ground level. Despite its strong conceptual and aesthetic qualities, it fails to display a full commitment to the programme, disregarding both study and project area's limits and lacking sufficient information regarding objectives for some of the areas.

Citação Especial / Honourable Mention

EN398 – Overall this entry sets the premises for a masterplan and elaborates on a theory for its development based on an urban grid that originates from the existing rail tracks and will merge into the existing urban fabric on the north-west margin. To the south-east margin the transition is achieved by means of an urban park which provides the adequate protection from the railway. The above mentioned grid is the base for all infrastructures including roads and plots for the proposed constructions. A modular building system has been proposed aiming at absolute flexibility of use of space both in terms of its internal typology as well as its function (housing, commercial, office, etc.). Apart from lacking tangible objectivity at a closer scale the proposal also fails to define construction areas, urban development indices and compliance with local regulations.

Citação Especial / Honourable Mention

MV004 – The proposal aims to integrate the city in a wider urban system of "rail-cities" sharing the same transport infrastructure. Furthermore it focuses in creating a set of mobile structures and happenings created from the railway imaginary in order to connect the various pre-existing and planned buildings. However, in doing so risks turning into an urban utopia and compromises the main purpose of creating a qualified urban structure articulating both its urban margins. It doesn't adequately solve the programme for zones A and B nor does it provide the required urban links. It also lacks information on housing numbers, construction areas and urban development indices.

Citação Especial / Honourable Mention

OO000 – This entry proposes two megastructures alongside the longitudinal edges of the intervention area in a direct analogy to the railway tracks. Those megastructures literally support a plug-in building system that is supposed to allow for interchangeable housing units of different typologies. Public space treatment is rather inexistent and there has been no compliance to the programme for Zone A nor to the mandatory conservation of the three "municipal interest" properties.

All in all, the proposal is underdeveloped in what concerns contextual goals. No pre-existing buildings remains standing and there is no influence to or from the surrounding urban context.

Citação Especial / Honourable Mention

SM659 – The main feature of this proposal is the railway quarters shaping the core of the project area and organizing new uses by means of several building blocks. However the project area seems disconnected from the industrial railway complex and there is an underdevelopment of the public space structure. A modular building system provides for rationalization of the construction process, aesthetic identity and typological diversity. Yet it fails to comply to several urban legal constraints and pedestrian crossing is not feasible.

C) Evaluation brief for Lisboa

Prémio / Winner

LX010 – A proposal for the creation a new asymmetrically sectioned avenue concept,

adjusting to site characteristics with morphological diversity in relations between buildings and between buildings and public spaces. Based on analyses of the tertiary city axis, the proposed solutions take public transport as space organizer. Although there's no emphasis on the avenue junctions, the options for future infrastructure evolution are opened with flexibility (related to future in airport area) while a new interior tissue is created with diversification of architectural types and continuity of green structure.

Menção Honrosa / Runner-Up

GP002 – A multifunctional proposal integrating several uses based on the overlapping of Lisbon traditional grids and architectonic diversity suggestions. However, the proposal is very conceptual, making it difficult to assess the effective capacity so as to offer a reasonable detail plan and failing in essential aspects: it doesn't refer to a central idea of an avenue as a large scale public gathering space; it has some non feasible features in the articulation of road networks and offers no real design for green's continuity.

Citação Especial / Honourable Mention

AA777 – The strong point of this proposal is the large central green area continuity between the university campus, the Campo Grande and the new Urban Park, articulated through the new forest-like allée. Strong solutions for the road junctions aim at a new typology in urban space although lacking clearer definition in some functional aspects. Exception made for the ground level avenue built front there is poor morphological articulation of new buildings to its surroundings urban design.

Citação Especial / Honourable Mention

DM193 – Integrated proposal for the new avenue layout: strong multifunctional solutions at road junctions, different building typologies and morphologies along and beside the avenue, new green area extensions and new public transportation network. However, the south road junction has a great impact on the ecological structure interruption and pedestrian circulation, with undeveloped solutions for the connection to University lane. Globally, the proposal largely exceed maximum floor space ratio.

Citação Especial / Honourable Mention

FA174 – Global strategic vision at a wider scale, assuring the growth of the city to the north the proposal cleverly refuses the goal of a new avenue and resets the reflection on a general background of the 2nd circular ring road's redesign as an urban street.

Main connections to the north are solved outside the site area, in which the new occupation proposed is not designed at architectural scale. Proposal maybe unfeasible in short term considering the brief conditions, but it makes a point defying central options to be taken.

Citação Especial / Honourable Mention

XX121 – With a clear identification of main focal points in the site area, the concept structures the site by assuring continuity of urban and natural structures. The avenue offers a multiuse mix integrating public transport solutions and options for future design of 2nd circular. However, little detail is given on housing typologies at architectural scale, the proposed urban fabric in a rather rigid reticular net is difficult in solving connections to existing buildings and allows doubts on the real feasibility resistance of the main idea.